

26

**ETHICS CASE STUDY TEST**

Time Allowed: 90 Mins.

Max. Marks: 120

Q.	Marks	Instructions to Candidate
1.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There are 6 questions.</li> <li>• All questions are compulsory</li> <li>• The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.</li> <li>• Content of the answer is more important than its length.</li> <li>• Answers must be written in the space provided.</li> <li>• Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.</li> </ul>
2.		
3.		
4.		
5.		
6.		

1. Invigilator Signature \_\_\_\_\_

2. Invigilator Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Name Madhumita

Roll No. \_\_\_\_\_

Mobile No. \_\_\_\_\_

Date \_\_\_\_\_

Signature Madhumita

Q1. You are a Superintendent of Police and a huge protest is going on in front of your office. These protesters are Human Right activists. Protest is because of two consecutive incidents happened in your district.

Case one: City SP has received intelligence input that bombs have been planted in various places in the city. SP asked his team for massive search operation. After putting in strenuous hard work, police team raided a house where two people with 2 kg of explosives and TED devices were found. Police team immediately arrested them and brought them to the police station. Police started interrogating them related to the whereabouts of the bombs and their plans. When they failed to take out information from them; one of the Police Officer adopted third degree. Torture in case of new criminals often works. But one of the person died during the process, as he failed to bear the pain of torture. (Death-in-police custody became a big issue.)

Case two: Recently communal riots occurred held in your area and few police constables got surrounded by a group, viewing the grave situation and possible threat on life, one of the constable picked a man as a human shield. They found it as easy way to escape as that could also save the life of other police constables. But while they were trying to escape, people started stone pelting and the person who was used as human shield get badly injured. However, he was saved later by proper treatment.

readily to police

Answer the following questions:

- Analyse the ethical dilemmas you will face as SP in both the stated situations?
- Human Rights Activists are demanding action against official involved in both the cases. What will be your course of action?
- Police Chief of State reaches to you and asks for not taking any action, as it will bring down the morals of the police force. What will be your course of action?
- Can you justify the use of torture technique in any given circumstances?
- Would you justify the use of human shield to save the lives of your colleagues? Give reasons. What are the moral and ethical issues involved in using human shield as the method of action against agitating mob? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

(a) <sup>The</sup> Superintendent of Police faces the following ethical dilemmas :-

(i) Under compulsion to take penal action against the police officer who was working in public interest. After all, threat of "Mass Casualties"

Remarks

Need to be aware of dilemma first

is imminent, if the location of bombs is not immediately.

(2) Under compulsion to take action against the constables who were doing their duty to pacify the Communal riot and for the fear of their losing their own lives, took one of the instigators of violence against them as human shield.

(3) If action is taken, teams may get demotivated. Are likely to prefer inaction in future for being punished while acting in good faith.

Discuss your dilemma clearly

(b) options before the SP -

1st Attempt: If doesn't work out then ↓  
 \* Suspend the officials involved after taking them in to confidence that it is only to pacify the activists protests (2nd option) OR - Is it a sincere approach  
 \* Explain the urgencies in both situation to HR activists and convince them to let the officials involved do their duty.

1

(c) \* Convince the police chief about the rising intensity of protests (if no action is taken)

Remarks

(2) Convince him to initiate an internal enquiry regarding the circumstances in which the death & injury (1st & 2nd case) took place.   
 *respectively*

(3) to Assure the H.R activists of taking action after the conclusion of enquiry.

All the three stakeholders shall be satisfied this way. However employees too have to be assured that no penal action would follow if they have acted in good faith (to keep them motivated & secure about their future).

(d) Use of violence should be done as the last resort when all options to take extract the information from the accused have been exhausted.

In this case, (1) Lives of thousands are at stake

- Not required
- (2) Location of bombs need to be known immediately
  - (3) Diffusing the bombs and

evacuating the Area immediately is the priority.

→ Here, use of torture is justified.

But the officers should get training in the methods of torture that cause pain but not death.

Here, this precaution was missing.

1/2

look for other alternative

(e) Justification of using human shield.

Yes :→ If the person was part of the mob targetting them

→ It saved the whole group of Constables from their possible death if ~~not~~<sup>went</sup> have used the shield

(Benefit of the maximum possible people) - Utilitarian principle is at work here

No : If the human shield was an innocent passerby.

They should have used other way out.

have other way out.

Moral-ethical issues involved

- ① life & liberty of the human shield
- ② sense of fear of losing their own lives (constables)
- ③ self protection vs the rights of violence instigator

1/2

Remarks

Q2. There was a conflict between the students of upper castes and Dalit community in a central university. The Dean and Vice Chancellor called a reconciliatory meeting, but it did not yield any result. The other day violence erupted in some parts of the university and some hostels. Examinations are very close. Some students have to submit their Ph.D thesis or M.Phil dissertations. Some politicians from a certain section put pressure on the Vice Chancellor to take action against the agitating students.

(a) Discuss various options available to the Vice Chancellor.

(b) Justify why these options are worth considering? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Ans : The issues involved are -

- ① caste based violence
- ② Political pressure in matters of students
- ③ Future of the students (careers at stake)
- ④ violence may lead to injury/deaths further causing caste based violence outside the university also (encourage caste based groups outside to indulge in violence)

Options available to the Vice-Chancellor

- ① Continue <sup>with</sup> ~~me~~ meetings to reconcile the student groups (may not yield any result; one has already failed)
- ② convince the politicians that efforts are on to pacify the agitating students and internal matters of the university can be solved by the

Remarks

adm University head amicably with dialogue.

③ Convince the politician about the possible violence outside the university if penal action is taken against students. (Largescale violence just needs a spark in an already divided society of rival groups)

→ The politicians may not listen to the Dean & may intervene directly further worsening the matters for the students.

④ Identify the leaders of both groups, take them into Confidence. Ask them to appeal to their Community members to instead Concentrate on exams. (leaders may have ulterior motives like backing of some political parties As part of larger conspiracy to polarise voters, staging violence in university may just be a means to it)

⑤ Use of Police force (request the SP) to arrest the violence instigators  
(Some innocents may be arrested, it will have

It's really none of his business

Not clear

Are they

Criminal at all?

Remarks

an adverse impact on their career and mental  
trauma of being punished despite being innocent.

### (b) Justification of options

(1) Continued efforts at reconciliation may yield some-peaceful solution to <sup>the</sup> issue.

(2) Politicians are powerful people who should be handled with care, avoiding any confrontation else may cause personal losses for the dem. i.e. Job losses or accusation in some exams etc.

(3) Convincing the politician of violent result of action against students is justified because their purpose of seeking action against agitators also point to their intention of maintaining peace in the university.

(4) It is always better to stop the instigators of violence at the individual level than firing on the mob.

(5) If situation gets out of control, police has to be called to handle the matter. (becomes law & order issue, <sup>in</sup> their mandate)

You need not appease politician

(6)

Remarks



Q3. You are a head of Water Supply Board of a district town and in-charge of supplying drinking water to the people. You had a detailed consultation with people regarding a Citizen Charter for water supply services. Based on the requirement and expectations of people, you had a discussion with your subordinates who were little reluctant about the Charter but seeing your positive attitude they ultimately agreed. You committed some hurry in implementation of the Charter and notice the following problems:

1. The quantum of water promised could not be ensured.
2. The quality of water did not improve.
3. One of your key functionaries went on a long leave and you did not get his replacement.
4. The entire blame on the failure of the Charter came on you.

Ponder over the situation and answer the following questions:

- (a) What were the reasons of failure of the Citizen Charter?
- (b) What should have been ideal course of action and why?
- (c) Draw a Citizen's Charter for this case. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Ans Citizen charter is a tool to empower the citizens vis-à-vis public service delivery. It tells people what they are entitled to? whom to complain to if don't get the promised?

(a) Reasons for failure of Citizen charter

① Consultation was carried out with people but

"Capacity constraints" → water availability to the district

→ Staff requirements to run the supply chain

→ decentralisation of work i.e. proper assigning of authority & responsibility to the staff for fixing accountability

Remarks

Discuss various reasons clearly.

① were not taken in to consideration  
prior to formulation of charter

② Ideal Course of action

① Organise a meeting with subordinates to  
get the \* data on water availability to the  
district

\* problems faced in delivery on time i.e.

broken pipelines

staff shortages

lack of equipments etc

\* Order a review of the entire supply chain  
from the origin to the end users.

only after having gathered the "Ground level  
facts, should he put the information

regarding water availability & capacity constraints

in public domain. Citizen should be consulted  
after this action only.

Remarks

\* Motivate the subordinate too to implement committed to public service, reminding of their duty.

2½

### (C) CITIZEN CHARTER

\* Name of the department

\* Duration for which water is supplied to taps (hours or timings etc)

\* Helpline to report if water is not available during scheduled time.

\* Nodal officer to address citizen's complaints (name, office address, phone no.)

\* Action against the officials for non-performance

Procedure for new connection

quality & quantity of water.

Remarks

Q4. Due to fall in agricultural productivity and faulty procurement policy, a marginal family head has committed suicide and left his family and two children, daughter (12 years) and son (8 years). They shifted to nearby city in search of work and ended up living in a slum. Both children had to leave their studies and mother went searching for some household work. Finally she is a maid at your home. She works at your personal residence. One day she felt ill and ask her daughter to continue in place of her. Your wife is an IAS officer and quite busy. She does not have time to take care of old in-laws who needs constant care. Though there is a nurse to take care of them but there is a need of help in small household works also. So she gave consent to daughter of maid to continue in place of her. As she fears that your family may engage someone else and she will loose livelihood opportunity. When you raised the concern, she replied that this is matter of few weeks only, and also saying no will bring them on street. As in such a metro city one cannot survive without work, everything has a cost. You are Mayor of the city.

- (a) What are the ethical dilemmas related to it?
- (b) Your wife is in support of her placement as domestic worker as it will help her in balancing household and work responsibilities. Do you find her justification right?
- (c) How will you persuade her to change her decision? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

(a) Ethical dilemmas

\* Empathy for the poor women - two small children, no work, no house, no food security. where will she go?

\* Child labour is crime, moral value too don't allow to exploit children as house helps, they should study & play at this age.

\* Wife is too busy, nurse can't manage it all. obligations towards ill parents, ~~with~~ they need care.

Remarks

\* Not employing the daughter (replacement for her mother) will make them seek the same work elsewhere.

(b) The wife is justified or not?

No:-

- ① Playing with children's future
- ② Taking advantage of helpless people
- ③ violating her duty of compassion for the weaker sections (As a civil servant)
- ④ Civil servants obligation of upholding the fundamental rights (Article 21 life & liberty)

Yes:-

- ① The replacement is temporary & as <sup>her</sup> mother shall resume work after recovery from illness
- ② She is too busy in her official work, needs help at home.
- ③ It's no harm because they have to work ultimately if not at her home, then elsewhere.

2

These do not make an illegal act legal.

Remarks

(c) Persuading her to change her decision

(d) \* Remind her of the legal consequences of employing child labour.

\* Warn of the consequences of employing a child help i.e. Public anger and media personal loss of face if matter is reported by the media.

\* Remind her of duty towards weaker sections.

\* Ask her to imagine herself in place of the child, How would she what would she

would have expected from an IAS officer

then - to employ her or to help her in rehabilitation.

Way forward

(1) Mayor - IAS couple: Influential & Well off - get the children enrolled in schools. (Govt schools) or under RTE, 2005 EWS quota

(2) Take NGO's help to cover their food and educational expenses & bids

(3) Register the women for govt. run health insurance schemes  
(4) Get the paper work completed to enroll them under PDS

Remarks

(5) offer place to her family in your servant's quarter  
fill them.

2 1/2

What is the fate of child eventually?

Need to discuss her

Q5. There is an entrepreneur who has opened a factory in the rural areas for the manufacture of sanitary ware. His initiative has helped in providing good employment opportunity to rural people and in the production of affordable sanitary products which are being used in construction of rural toilets. However there are some cases of under payment of wages and few cases of employment of children below 14 yrs. You are labour enforcement officer of the area and in course of your routine inspection, you noticed these discrepancies. Answer the following.

- (a) What are the options available to you?  
 (b) Discuss the merits/demerits of each option and finally choose the option which you consider best with suitable justifications. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Ans: The entrepreneur is serving two important noble causes here. These two are also in support of the flagship schemes of the government -

① \* Swachh Bharat Abhiyan  
 \* Street Swabhiman initiative  
 ↓  
 personal hygiene of women in particular (menstrual hygiene)

↳ sanitation & hygiene of public places in general

② National rural livelihood mission - generation of jobs in rural areas.

① Options available to

\* Warn the entrepreneur of the consequences of violation of minimum wages act

Remarks

\* Prohibition of child labour act.

✓ Warning at first, instead of action because  
he may <sup>be</sup> lacking awareness of the issues.

- need to give benefit of doubt to a person  
(working in genuine public interest)

✓ But he may not pay attention to mere  
warning if deliberately doing these violations  
of laws.

\* Take strict action — arrest & fines under  
the above acts.

→ may demotivate him for having done  
little wrong unknowingly despite good  
intentions.

option 1

Remarks

Discuss  
merit &  
demerit  
of each  
option  
separately

3



*Remarks*

Q6. One of your friend, a mid-level bureaucrat, is highly upset because of his job related stress and family problems and often expresses his disenchantment with life. He gave an application for 3 week leave, which was sanctioned by his boss. However, a senior officer (placed higher than his boss), called him during his leave period to office for handling a sudden exigency and this was not the first time when such a thing had happened to him. It happens very often because the officer is very efficient and reliable. The officer has a feeling that those who work honestly are overused while those who work less but keep a personal liaison with seniors work less and get various rewards and privileges. He is disillusioned. He is unable to give reasonable time to his ageing sick mother, his wife who is under depression and children who are going to face their 10th and 12th board examinations. The officer is very upset and broken because of his inability to reconcile his official duties and family responsibilities. He seems to be very disturbed and broken. Despite being an honest and efficient officer he has not been given adequate rewards and recognition and space for looking after his personal needs; he displays signals of suicidal tendencies. What would be your suggestions to him? Discuss merits and demerits of each option. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

*Remarks*

*Remarks*

*Remarks*