

## ETHICS CASE STUDY TEST

Time Allowed: 90 Mins.

Max. Marks: 120

Q.	Marks	Instructions to Candidate
1.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There are 6 questions.</li> <li>• All questions are compulsory</li> <li>• The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.</li> <li>• Content of the answer is more important than its length.</li> <li>• Answers must be written in the space provided.</li> <li>• Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.</li> </ul>
2.		
3.		
4.		
5.		
6.		
<div style="border: 1px solid black; border-radius: 50%; width: 100px; height: 100px; display: flex; align-items: center; justify-content: center; margin: 0 auto;"> <span style="font-size: 2em; font-weight: bold;">22</span> </div>		

1. Invigilator Signature \_\_\_\_\_

2. Invigilator Signature \_\_\_\_\_



Name Shruti Sarinastana

Roll No. \_\_\_\_\_

Mobile No. \_\_\_\_\_

Date 1 \_\_\_\_\_

Signature Shruti \_\_\_\_\_

Q1. You are a Superintendent of Police and a huge protest is going on in front of your office. These protesters are Human Right activists. Protest is because of two consecutive incidents happened in your district.

*Case one:* City SP has received intelligence input that bombs have been planted in various places in the city. SP asked his team for massive search operation. After putting in strenuous hard work, police team raided a house where two people with 2 kg of explosives and IED devices were found. Police team immediately arrested them and brought them to the police station. Police started interrogating them related to the whereabouts of the bombs and their plans. When they failed to take out information from them; one of the Police Officer adopted third degree. Torture in case of new criminals often works. But one of the person died during the process, as he failed to bear the pain of torture. Death in police custody became a big issue.

*Case two:* Recently communal riots occurred held in your area and few police constables got surrounded by a group, viewing the grave situation and possible threat on life, one of the constable picked a man as a human shield. They found it as easy way to escape as that could also save the life of other police constables. But while they were trying to escape, people started stone pelting and the person who was used as human shield get badly injured. However, he was saved later by proper treatment.

Answer the following questions:

- (a) Analyse the ethical dilemmas you will face as SP in both the stated situations.
- (b) Human Rights Activists are demanding action against official involved in both the cases. What will be your course of action?
- (c) Police Chief of State reaches to you and asks for not taking any action, as it will bring down the morals of the police force. What will be your course of action?
- (d) Can you justify the use of torture technique in any given circumstances?
- (e) Would you justify the use of human shield to save the lives of your colleagues? Give reasons. What are the moral and ethical issues involved in using human shield as the method of action against agitating mob? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Remarks

①

As a Superintendent of Police, my first step should be to maintain peace in my area. Then to address the concerns of the Human Right protectors, but these are some constraints doing that, as both the incidents, which led to the protest, requires delicate handling.

Issues are - <sup>Issue</sup> My role & responsibility as a SP, I have to take action ~~any~~ against any sort of wrongdoings, even if it is done by ~~of~~ my Department. I am answerable to my people.

Dilemmas are ~~problem~~: The case of death in a police custody though is a big issue but was not completely intentional. Majority of lives were at stake, but at the same time some ~~strict~~ action has to be taken because so that 3<sup>rd</sup> degree torture does not become an easy <sup>option</sup> ~~tool~~ for police.

①

In second case, again the dilemma is about taking action against the constable. But <sup>at</sup> ~~the~~ fact that the constables are not properly trained for such incidents, the constable can be given some leverage, but making a distinction as a human should ~~it~~ cannot be

Not a sincere answer  
Remarks

Do write your answer with the 3<sup>rd</sup> degree part of the space

Justified at any cost.

Avoid it

(B)

Actions demanded by Human Right activists against both the officials is not entirely wrong but before taking any action a proper enquiry should be made of whole case incident in both the cases. As an

S.P. my foremost duty is towards my people, a culprit or not, the person died in the police custody deserves justice. As the law of our land considers everyone innocent until proven guilty. But while taking action the intention of the official should be counted that he was motivated to save life of larger no. of people.

Make small & meaningful sentence

1/2

(C)

Not taking any action is not an option. For boosting moral of the police force we can do many things - award them for their bravery, hold programme for them for recognizing their contribution & sacrifices. But this message should be given to them that they are not above the law. How can it be given?

1/2

Remarks

How can it be given?

d) The Police has <sup>their</sup> procedure for taking out information but those processes should be ethical. A ~~war~~ war. But in some cases like the ~~war~~ war security where the larger security is at stake sometimes they go for third degree torture. But that also should be kept <sup>under</sup> bearable limits, crossing those limits is certainly achievable. For instance making ~~a~~ a civilian a human shield is ~~completely~~ completely cannot be justified.

You really need to improve your skill. need to presentation

Q2. There was a conflict between the students of upper castes and Dalit community in a central university. The Dean and Vice Chancellor called a reconciliatory meeting, but it did not yield any result. The other day violence erupted in some parts of the university and some hostels. Examinations are very close. Some students have to submit their Ph.D thesis or M.Phil dissertations. Some politicians from a certain section put pressure on the Vice Chancellor to take action against the agitating students.

(a) Discuss various options available to the Vice Chancellor.

(b) Justify why these options are worth considering? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

Conflicts b/w students in colleges univs are not a big issue unless it takes it also has the potential to create a fine birth to any communal violence or riots etc. This conflict b/w upper caste & Dalit community is a big ~~issue~~ & serious issue because it has the potential to spread, can go violent, is ~~off~~ directly affecting the University curriculum & of course the study of students involved in it. Thus as a chancellor it is of total importance to ~~at~~ recognise & address each & every issue involve in this matter.

(a) Various Options -

To: Through the help of an Inquiry Committee find out the root cause & students involved in initiating the conflict & take strict action against them.

Remarks

merits:- This will serve as a warning signal for other students taking part in the conflict to back off, ~~their~~

Demerits:- Now that this conflict has taken over the university & other hostels, holding only 4-5 students with care further aggravate the problem & to other students

- At this crucial stage of education, taking any action against the students will have a great impact on their career. ∴ it is important to make sure that they are only punished for the amount of crime they have committed.   
 ↓  
 It's incorrect way.

2<sup>nd</sup> option:- Calling out a meeting involving groups of form both the communities & some other important officials of the Univ administration to try to understand & go deep into the problem. And then provide them with some sort of solution so that both the groups now can be at ease & explain the examination process can go smoothly.

merits:- Most effective approach towards this sort of problem. No false use of police or force thus protecting to their (students)

Remarks

Security :

Demands - not much, but if the talks do not go well or any of the side do not remain dissatisfied with the conclusion, the violence can erupt again & this time serious measures should be taken.

But,

What can be other viable option in this regard?



Q3. You are a head of Water Supply Board of a district town and in-charge of supplying drinking water to the people. You had a detailed consultation with people regarding a Citizen Charter for water supply services. Based on the requirement and expectations of people, you had a discussion with your subordinates who were little reluctant about the Charter but seeing your positive attitude they ultimately agreed. You committed some hurry in implementation of the Charter and notice the following problems:

1. The quantum of water promised could not be ensured.
2. The quality of water did not improve.
3. One of your key functionaries went on a long leave and you did not get his replacement.
4. The entire blame on the failure of the Charter came on you.

Ponder over the situation and answer the following questions:

- (a) What were the reasons of failure of the Citizen Charter?
- (b) What should have been ideal course of action and why?
- (c) Draw a Citizen's Charter for this case.

(250 Words) (20 Marks)

As a head, ~~before~~

At a head of the board, detailed consultation with the people regarding citizen charter for water supply is a good move, probably what this is what exactly should be done. But despite being on the right track some issues which cannot be ignored can erupt why?

Main reason might be :-

- the consultation was made in hurry thus <sup>some</sup> ~~the~~ details related to data/quantity was <sup>crucial</sup> left undiscussed.

Remarks

②  
Ground reality was not checked.

- Many people are not aware of atomic charter completely this leaving the gap for cross questioning etc.

- while discussing & planning out, we require field experts or experts in that domain, only sets detailed discussion is not enough.

(b) What should have been done instead?

- There is not definite set of rules as what could be done to avoid such results but some basics should always be kept in mind

\* Always include expert

• After detailed discussion with people about their requirements, the whole project should go through an expert committee where there can be detailed discussions about what best could be done given the current resource that we have.

• & what else technological improvements could have been made.

• more innovative solutions

• There should be no hurry in such projects as it the investment made on

②  
Remarks

it are huge and cannot afford any  
mistakes.

Remarks

Q4. Due to fall in agricultural productivity and faulty procurement policy, a marginal family head has committed suicide and left his family and two children, daughter (12 years) and son (8 years). They shifted to nearby city in search of work and ended up living in a slum. Both children had to leave their studies and mother went searching for some household work. Finally she is a maid at your home. She works at your personal residence. One day she felt ill and ask her daughter to continue in place of her. Your wife is an IAS officer and quite busy. She does not have time to take care of old in-laws who needs constant care. Though there is a nurse to take care of them but there is a need of help in small household works also. So she gave consent to daughter of maid to continue in place of her. As she fears that your family may engage someone else and she will loose livelihood opportunity. When you raised the concern, she replied that this is matter of few weeks only, and also saying no will bring them on street. As in such a metro city one cannot survive without work, everything has a cost. You are Mayor of the city.

- (a) What are the ethical dilemmas related to it?
- (b) Your wife is in support of her placement as domestic worker as it will help her in balancing household and work responsibilities. Do you find her justification right?
- (c) How will you persuade her to change her decision? (250 Words) (20 Marks)

④ Ethical dilemmas are:

- Putting a 12 years as a helper replacement for work of maid is child labouring and is a serious legal issue.
- There is ~~another~~ a moral issue of leaving a person unemployed in a big city with who is a sole bread winner for her family in this big city & has a responsibility towards her ~~two~~ two children as it is not easy to survive, they might fall in bad ~~act~~ trap hands & ruin their lives.
- I have also responsibilities towards my family & my parents. But this is

Remarks

Make your dilemma clear

not a serious issue, as i am capable of  
employing some other caretaker to take  
look after my parents & my family.

avoid  
it

2)

As the wife is an IAS officer, she also has  
has great deal of work to do and is  
responsible towards the family. Thus for  
balancing her household & work responsibility  
her decision for a replacement of the maid  
is quite justified but that her replacement  
should not be for a 12 years old. As because  
being a conv servant is also her responsibility  
to curb these problems not use it for  
her own convenience.

e)

The situation is no doubt critical & involves  
a st delicate discussion. leaving the maid  
& her family on their own completely?  
unemployed should not be the option?  
the replacement should be made with  
other servant on temporary basis until  
she gets gain health & meanwhile  
we should provide them with the assistance

Remarks

Need not  
adjoin two different  
word through  
curative.

2  
that she requires in recovering. He  
I meanwhile help her kids in getting  
education that they need at this age  
as per my capacity.

Remarks

Q5. There is an entrepreneur who has opened a factory in the rural areas for the manufacture of sanitary ware. His initiative has helped in providing good employment opportunity to rural people and in the production of affordable sanitary products which are being used in construction of rural toilets. However there are some cases of under payment of wages and few cases of employment of children below 14 yrs. You are labour enforcement officer of the area and in course of your routine inspection, you noticed these discrepancies. Answer the following.

- (a) What are the options available to you?  
 (b) Discuss the merits/demerits of each option and finally choose the option which you consider best with suitable justifications. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

The entrepreneur's factory has provided ~~the~~ people with the ~~much~~ employment which was much needed in that area and also is helping the other cause, of providing construction materials at much affordable rate in ~~the~~ construction of toilets which is now one of the major priority of Govt & people. But these good acts cannot become a blanket for other ~~the~~ much troublesome issues.

As a labour enforcement officer following are the options available to me.

Options:-

- (a) Ask the entrepreneur about to give complete report of the people employed under him  
merits → Transparency  
Demerits:- might ~~not~~ Temper the data.

Remarks

- Ask him about the workers about the wage condition.

Demerits:

merits: asking the workers would give more accurate description of what is happening.

Demerits: might stain the name of the factory which is otherwise doing very good work in the area.

Employing children under 14 years is a legal offence & is punishable. Thus ~~leg~~ even though there are not mention of them in the workers diary, but a proper ~~do~~ inspection should be made occasionally to ensure that there is no such employment made.

~~educate the~~ Sometimes parents of such children deny to come forward & part to understand the gravity of child labouring issue. because they (children) though underage, are bringing money to the family which helps them anyway. ∴ it is important to educate

Remarks



show about the dangers of working in factory  
for the children.

4

Discuss every  
option with its  
merit & demerit  
clearly.

Remarks

- Q6. One of your friend, a mid-level bureaucrat, is highly upset because of his job related stress and family problems and often expresses his disenchantment with life. He gave an application for 3 week leave, which was sanctioned by his boss. However, a senior officer (placed higher than his boss), called him during his leave period to office for handling a sudden exigency and this was not the first time when such a thing had happened to him. It happens very often because the officer is very efficient and reliable. The officer has a feeling that those who work honestly are overused while those who work less but keep a personal liaison with seniors work less and get various rewards and privileges. He is disillusioned. He is unable to give reasonable time to his ageing sick mother, his wife who is under depression and children who are going to face their 10th and 12th board examinations. The officer is very upset and broken because of his inability to reconcile his official duties and family responsibilities. He seems to be very disturbed and broken. Despite being an honest and efficient officer he has not been given adequate rewards and recognition and space for looking after his personal needs; he displays signals of suicidal tendencies. What would be your suggestions to him? Discuss merits and demerits of each option. (250 Words) (20 Marks)

The problem in this case is a rather complex & there is a clash of responsibility towards his family & his official duties - when

But there are some other ~~part~~ <sup>factor</sup> ~~recuse~~ <sup>surroundings</sup> in the ~~perthory~~ <sup>perthory</sup> surroundings which are making the case even worse.

- The work environment is not very healthy. Disillusioned or not, ~~each~~ every employee/officer deserves appreciation & recognition for the good ~~work~~ <sup>will</sup> & effort they put in their work which makes them reliable & valuable resource. They if they can help are doing/sto <sup>to</sup> th giving their best in the jobs.

Remarks

they deserves good treatment also. Given the condition. a little gap is what much his needed. for him right now. given his & his family condition.



→ Make your hand writing clear  
→ Do write within the provided space

Remarks

*Remarks*